

Oakwood, Dayton, Ohio

October 22, 2008

The planning commission of the City of Oakwood, State of Ohio, met this date in the council chambers of the City of Oakwood, city building, 30 Park Ave., Dayton, Ohio, 45419, at 4:30 p.m.

The Chair, Mr. Jeffrey Shulman, presided and Jay Weiskircher, recorded.

Upon call of the roll, the following members responded to their names:

MR. JEFFREY B. SHULMAN.....PRESENT  
MR. ANDREW AIDT.....PRESENT  
MRS. REBECCA BUTLER.....ABSENT  
MRS. HARRISON GOWDY.....PRESENT  
MR. STEVEN BYINGTON.....PRESENT

Officers of the city present were the following:

Mr. Norbert S. Klopsch, City Manager  
Mr. Jay A. Weiskircher, Assistant City Manager  
Mr. Dave Bunting, City Inspector  
Mr. Steven McHugh, Altick & Corwin

The following visitors registered:

Kent Fullmer, 9547 W. Third St., 45427  
Reuben Huffman, 12537 Havermale, 45325  
Martha Haley, 400 Irving Avenue, 45409  
Elana Bolling, 405 Kramer Road, 45419  
Julie Brecount Patel, 460 Kramer Road, 45419  
Nancy Bain, 444 Acorn Drive, 45419  
Ordeman, 619 Oakwood Avenue, 45419  
Susan Harris, 1900 Southwood Lane, 45419  
Tracy Sturgis, 112 Far Hills Avenue, 45419  
Cindy Garner, 1150 Oakwood Avenue, 45419  
Barbara Rion, 2325 Ridgeway Road, 45419  
George & Pam Houk, 310 W. Schantz Avenue, 45409  
Bob Pohl, 144 W. Thruston Blvd., 45419

It was moved by Mr. Aidt and seconded by Mr. Byington that Mrs. Butler's absence for medical reasons be excused. Upon a viva voce vote on the question of the motion, same passed unanimously and it was so ordered.

It was moved by Ms. Gowdy and seconded by Mr. Byington that the minutes of the planning commission meeting held October 1, 2008 be approved as submitted and the reading thereof be dispensed with at this session. Upon a viva voce vote on the question of the motion, the same passed unanimously and it was so ordered.

Mr. Weiskircher requested of the Chair that staff be permitted to delay the presentation on the Pointe Oakwood Master Landscape Plan as several members of the Tree and Landscaping Committee will be a few minutes late. Mr. Shulman directed Mr. Weiskircher to proceed with a presentation on the Pointe Oakwood Record Plan.

Mr. Weiskircher noted that the developers have submitted a Record Plan for the Pointe Oakwood residential portion of the Sugar Camp Development. He noted that the Record Plan encompasses 26.403 acres, and includes 58 single residence lots ranging in size from .150 to .52 acres. The lots along Far Hills Avenue and continuing along the north side of West Schantz to the Maysfield Road intersection vary in size from .18 to .275 acres, with most lots in the .23 acre range - comparable to R-4 zoning. In response to an inquiry from Ms. Gowdy, Mr. Weiskircher noted that the properties along Irving Avenue are zoned R-

4. Mr. Weiskircher went on to add that there are twelve (12) lots along the north boundary of the property which will accommodate 24 attached units. He added that there is also a .19 acre parcel along West Schantz Avenue which will serve as a public park. Mr. Weiskircher indicated that the Record Plan was developed by the developers' consulting engineer, Mike Oxner, and that the city's consulting engineer, John Eastman of LJB, along with the city's Director of Engineering and Public Works, Kevin Weaver, are in the process of reviewing the Record Plan. City staff anticipates that some minor changes will be needed before the Plan is ready to be signed by the Chairman and forwarded to Montgomery County.

Mr. Williams added that the developers intend to record only the public streets portion of the Record Plan until such time as the lots are actually sold. In response to a question from Mr. Aidt, Mr. Williams indicated that Springhouse Boulevard and both sections of Pointe Oakwood Way will be built next spring and in all likelihood, except for a cut that will permit access to potential buyers, Ledges Trail Drive, which is located along the top of the hill, will not be constructed until late 2009.

Application #08-10, the request of OIG/Versant to approve a Master Landscape Plan for the Pointe Oakwood portion of the Sugar Camp Development was presented. Mr. Weiskircher referenced a Power Point presentation and reviewed the following. As tree and vegetation removal proceeded on the Pointe Oakwood portion of the development earlier this year, a number of citizens inquired about plans for replacing trees and landscaping the area. Mr. Weiskircher mentioned that staff had intended to defer presentation of a Master Landscape Plan until infrastructure improvements were further along but given community concerns, staff asked the developers to proceed with developing the Master Landscape Plan. Up until that time the developers had not devoted any significant time to tree and landscape proposals, but Mr. Williams had expressed an interest in planting trees along all public roadways. A preliminary plan depicting the planting of more than 230 "Cleveland Select" pear trees was shared with the community. This plan was never intended to serve as the Master Plan, but was merely a preliminary proposal detailing the developers' intent to replace trees and vegetation that had been removed from the site. A number of citizens expressed concerns not only about the choice of the pear trees since they are considered by many to be an invasive species, but also the lack of species diversity in the plan. In response to these concerns, the city formed a Tree and Landscape Advisory Committee that included eight (8) citizens with extensive backgrounds and experiences in gardening and environmental issues. The Committee met on two (2) occasions over the summer with city staff, the developers and the developers' landscaping consultant. During the first meeting in July, members of the committee expressed their concerns with the selection of the pear trees - the featured tree to be used along the public roadways, citing the invasive nature of the pear tree. Mr. Williams explained that he had chosen the pear tree because of its shape, spring beauty and the availability of specimens in the 5 to 6 inch caliper range. Other comments and ideas shared during the July meeting were incorporated into a more detailed Tree and Landscaping Plan that was presented to the Committee in early September. At that meeting, Mr. Williams announced that he had abandoned plans to use pear trees and was instead proposing a plan that included using groupings of English Oaks. During the September meeting there was also discussion about the species of trees to be used to enhance the edges of the remaining treestand; the formal hedge being proposed along Far Hills Avenue; and, the planting of various species of shade trees to the west of the units fronting Far Hills Avenue. There was a lengthy discussion about the Far Hills Avenue hedge and the need to identify a species that could tolerate winter salt spray. Mr. Weiskircher noted that ideas and suggestions from the September meeting have been incorporated into the Master Landscape Plan being presented this evening.

Mr. Williams stated that proposed Master Landscape Plan has evolved over time and thanked the members of the Tree and Landscape Committee for their ideas and input. He noted that the trees and landscaping are being used in a way that will complement and enhance the architectural theme planned for the development.

Mr. Kent Fullmer of Fullmer's Landscaping reviewed various components of the Plan noting that a living arbor will be used at the front entrance to the development, and that either a privet or bayberry hedge will be planted along the Far Hills Avenue frontage. Mr. Fullmer went on to point out that English Oaks will be planted in groupings along the public roadways, and that various species of trees, as proposed by the

Committee, will be used to extend the remaining treestand on the upper portion of the site. Mr. Fullmer commented on the island plantings and noted that pavers and accent lighting will be used to enhance the overall appearance of the islands. Mr. Fullmer also reviewed a typical internal landscaping plan for a villa unit.

Ms. Barbara Rion inquired about the committee's suggestion that bayberry be used rather than privot. Mr. Fuller explained that the smaller leaf privot is a preferred option rather than the large leaf bayberry because of salt spray issues along Far Hills Avenue.

Ms. Woodhull inquired whether there were adequate shade trees included in the Plan. Mr. Fullmer noted that shade trees will be planted behind the units that front Far Hills Avenue, but not along the public roadways. Mr. Williams noted that the tree and vegetation plantings along the entrance to the development, the Far Hills Avenue frontage and the boulevard areas will be accomplished during the first half of 2009.

Nancy Bain commented about the importance of having a public discussion on invasive plant material and noted that although the developer has made changes to the original plans and eliminated some invasive trees and plants, there are still invasive species included in the plan being presented to the Planning Commission. She went on to thank the developers for being open-minded and gracious. Ms. Bolling commented that the issues raised by Ms. Bain are important and should be part of an on-going community dialogue on the effects of invasive plant material.

Mr. Shulman commented that the city of Oakwood is an environmentally conscious community. Mr. Fullmer added that the State of Ohio does not currently have a protocol in place for identifying invasive plants. Mr. Fullmer also noted the importance of using tree and plant material that enhance the appearance of the development.

Mr. Shulman requested that Mr. Fullmer sit down with Ms. Bain and other members of the Committee to work through remaining issues involving invasive plant material.

Cindy Garner thanked Planning Commission members, city staff, Mr. Rinzler and Mr. Williams for allowing the members of the citizen design review team the opportunity to be a part of the Master Landscape Plan. The citizen design review team shares a common interest in preserving the uniqueness and integrity of our special community. Ms. Garner reiterated that the Committee was asked to make suggestions regarding plant material and its usage throughout the development only, not the design. Ms. Garner stated the Committee is pleased that the developers listened to their appeal for the use of non-invasive native plants wherever possible. She also stated that the plan being presented today still contains suggestions for invasive plant material, however, the committee is requesting that appropriate alternatives be substituted. Ms. Garner stated that the use of euonymous alata "Compacta" or burning bush is very much a concern as burning bush is already an invasive threat in our woodlands and added that burning bush is nearing the equivalent of the bush honeysuckle. Ms. Garner added that privot hedge is another invasive plant, but the committee was unable to come up with a feasible alternative. Mr. Fullmer mentioned barberry as a possible alternative, but since barberry is also invasive and has thorns, the committee's recommendation would be bayberry. Ms. Garner suggested that a design alternative to the "living wall" along Far Hills and Schantz Avenue be considered. Ms. Garner commented that there is no street in the city where more than five of the same kind of tree has been planted in a city block which results in a very natural and harmonious aesthetic appearance. However, the proposed landscape plan at Pointe Oakwood is one that is forced and constrained and cautioned the Board in approving a landscape plan which will require extensive maintenance.

Julie Patel remarked that she, too, is concerned about the proposed use of invasive plant material and added that she has literature in her possession that identifies non-invasive trees and plant material.

Mr. Byington noted that there are already invasive trees and plants existing throughout the community. He asked what should be done where these trees and plant material already exist. Ms. Garner

acknowledged that there is not much that can be done about the existing plant material other than educating the public of the problems associated with invasive trees and plants. Ms. Garner further noted that if a hedge taller than the 24 inches being proposed by the developers is used along Far Hills Avenue, there are a number of species that can be considered besides privot.

Mr. Aidt suggested that based upon the comments made this evening, some of the plant material being proposed still needs to be massaged. Therefore, it was moved by Mr. Aidt and seconded by Mr. Byington that the Master Landscape Plan for Pointe Oakwood be approved with the condition that city staff and the developers work with the Tree and Landscaping Committee regarding issues raised this evening, and that any significant changes to the proposed Master Landscape Plan will have to be brought back to the Planning Commission for approval. Upon a viva voce vote on the question of the motion, the same passed unanimously and it was so ordered.

Mr. Weiskircher referenced a letter he received earlier in the day from Mr. Routsong's attorney advising that his client was not in a position to present an alternative proposal to the Planning Commission in October. Mr. Weiskircher added that based upon his conversation with Mr. Schaeffer, it was very unlikely that Mr. Routsong will be ready for the scheduled November 5 Planning Commission meeting.

Mr. Weiskircher made a brief Power Point presentation highlighting work currently underway at Sugar Camp, Pointe Oakwood and the Orchard Drive Parking Lot. He added that the earth work at Pointe Oakwood will continue during the winter months as weather permits.

Mr. Rinzler provided an update on the leasing of building space within the Sugar Camp Development. He noted that renovation work is underway on Building A and it is anticipated the space will be ready for occupancy by year's end. Mr. Rinzler indicated that he is in the process of finalizing contractual details for the leasing of the top floor in Building D. The unidentified tenant will be bringing approximately 65 IT employees onto the site. Mr. Rinzler noted that as the plans have evolved, especially with respect to the mid-rise buildings, he can confirm that the build-out value for the commercial and residential components of the development are still in the \$90 million range.

There being no further business, the public meeting adjourned at 6: 40 p.m.

---

CHAIR

ATTEST:

---

ACTING CLERK