

Oakwood, Dayton, Ohio

February 9, 2012

The planning commission of the City of Oakwood, State of Ohio, met this date in the council chambers of the City of Oakwood, city building, 30 Park Ave., Dayton, Ohio, 45419, at 4:30 p.m.

The Chair, Mr. Jeffrey Shulman, presided and the Clerk, Mrs. Cathy Gibson, recorded.

Upon call of the roll, the following members responded to their names:

MR. JEFFREY B. SHULMAN ..... PRESENT  
MR. ANDREW AIDT ..... PRESENT  
MRS. HARRISON GOWDY ..... PRESENT  
MRS. E. HEALY JACKSON ..... PRESENT  
MR. STEVE BYINGTON ..... PRESENT

Officers of the city present were the following:

Mr. Norbert S. Klopsch, City Manager  
Mr. Robert F. Jacques, City Attorney  
Mr. Jay A. Weiskircher, Assistant City Manager  
Mr. Dave Bunting, City Inspector

The following visitors registered:

Martha Haley, 400 Irving Avenue  
Jack Omer, 4272 Wehner Road  
April Jordan, 124 E. Third St.  
Howard Schottenstein, Bexley, OH  
Scott Peters, Senior Living Solutions Group  
Nancy Pratzner, VP, Senior Residential Care, Vogt Santer Insights  
Lee Schear, 1130 Harman Avenue  
Mark Risley, 151 Aberdeen Avenue  
Tom Wild, 126 W. Dixon  
Earl Reeder, 346 Jones  
John Smart, 612 Delaware Avenue  
Nina Anglin, Oakwood Florist  
Karen Haverland, Roanoke

It was moved by Mr. Aidt and seconded by Mrs. Gowdy that the minutes of the commission meeting held January 4, 2012 be approved as submitted and the reading thereof be dispensed with. Upon a viva voce vote on the question of the motion, same passed unanimously and it was so ordered.

Mr. Shulman reviewed the meeting procedure with the audience. He noticed the next item on the agenda is appointment to the Pointe Oakwood Design Review Committee. Mr. Klopsch explained at the last council meeting, an ordinance was adopted that formalized the requirement that before being submitted to the city for zoning review, building plans must be approved by the Design Review Board and that a member of the Planning Commission shall be a member of that three member review board. He had asked Mrs. Gowdy if she was interested and asked the commission if they concur. Mr. Shulman wished her good luck.

It was moved by Mr. Shulman and seconded by Mr. Aidt that Mrs. Gowdy be appointed as the Planning Commission representative on the Pointe Oakwood Design Review Board. Upon a viva voce vote on the question of the motion, same passed unanimously and it was so ordered.

Application #12-2, the application submitted by Oakwood Investment Group LLC to amend the Master Plan for Pointe Oakwood originally approved on April 23, 2007 and amended in May, 2008 and February, 2011 to include a 3 story, 88 unit, 88,727 s.f. residential assisted living facility at the corner of Far Hills Avenue and Old River Trail, was presented.

Mr. Byington recused himself from this application based on the proximity of his home to the property and noted this is per the direction of legal counsel which he doesn't agree with.

Mr. Weiskircher indicated Lee Schear, owner of Sugar Camp and Pointe Oakwood, and his project team are here to answer questions. For background purposes, over the past 23 years the city has looked at this property and several studies/plans have been undertaken. The 2004 Comprehensive Plan discussed the need for new residential units, senior housing including assisted living, and a high quality mixed use development on this property. Mr. Weiskircher referenced a PowerPoint on the application which the Commission will review and then forward a recommendation to City Council. He reviewed a comparison chart of the Master Plan from the 2007 original plan, the 2008 amended plan and the current plan which nets 125 residential units in 2007, 147 units in 2008 to a current 128 residential units. The next slides included the 2007 plan, the 2008 plan, photo of the proposed site, and record plot plan with the proposed assisted living center, the lots with homes under construction and the current model. Mr. Weiskircher reviewed the proposed site plan, elevation drawings, floor plans, studio unit plan, as well as one and two bedroom unit plans. The next chart compared the existing Brookdale Assisted Living facility on Far Hills to the proposed facility as it relates to year built, cost, architecture, building height and size, units and parking. The next slide depicted a photo of the Old River parking lot area. Since there is a lack of parking, the developer approached NCR about the availability of the adjacent parcel for surface parking. NCR declined to sell the property so staff has suggested that perhaps the application could use available parking at Old River, a 600' walk. Remaining details include: develop landscape plan with staff assistance; complete drainage study; work out details on use of Old River parking lot; develop lighting and exterior sign plan with staff assistance; and confirm exterior building materials and color scheme. He indicated these final details will be worked out and brought back to be reviewed by the commission before being forwarded to city council.

Mr. Schear extended thanks to Mr. Weiskircher and the city for all their help during this process, as well as the Commission for their time. He previewed this project at their last meeting and noted a lot of hours and money have been spent on this plan. Since he took over the property it's been his goal to work aggressively on the project and has done a lot of research for this request to provide a unique assisted living development. He has worked with many experts and consultants and the primary participants are available for questions. He introduced April Jordan, OIG legal counsel; Bob Posner, Chief Operating Officer; Earl Reeder, architect and designer; Scott Peters, Administrative Director/Development Consultants Services with Senior Living Solutions Group; Nancy Prutzer, VP/Senior Residential Care with Vogt Santer Insights who provided marketing research; and Howard Schottenstein, well known Columbus developer.

Mr. Howard Schottenstein is honored to be a member of this great team of experts. He conducted boring samples and found the ground to be lousy; however, there is a fairly new process that permits a solid foundation to be built on granular material. They conducted environmental studies and all have been positive that a building can be built at this site. Mr. Schottenstein indicated he met with Mr. Reeder to help design a building that would blend with the community and believes Mr. Reeder has come up with a wonderful building that can be built within a reasonable budget.

Mr. Schear explained the next step was to undertake market research for this unique need and he contacted Nancy Prutzer with Vogt Santer Insights, in Columbus. They provided a market study based on national research and local feasibility.

Ms. Prutzer explained her task was to undertake a marketing feasibility study for the use at this site based on supply and demand. They reviewed occupancy rates and unit sizes of rentals, senior residential care, nursing, independent living facilities in the area against demand based on aging trends, income, and demographics. Ms. Prutzer explained they discovered the occupancy rate in the area is very high compared to national standards and a facility like this could be supported in this prime location. The study showed there are not adequate facilities and suggested up to 136 additional assisted living rooms and 100 memory care rooms can be supported, but to be conservative, they only recommend half that

number. Mr. Shulman asked about occupancy percentages. Ms. Prutzer indicated she has that data.

Mr. Schear explained once they determined an assisted living facility was feasible on this nearly two acre site, and since he didn't know much about such facilities, he contacted the best in the region for assistance – Scott Peters with Senior Living Solutions. He noted Mr. Peters has worked on many assisted facilities including Marriott, Sunrise, etc.

Mr. Peters indicated once he had the study from Ms. Prutzer, they drew up a model of what was needed, sustainable and financially viable for long term use. They created a financial model based on number of units, styles, etc. The facility will employ 50 individuals with over \$1.3M in annual salaries and will create a special and unique product in area.

Mr. Schear indicated once the market research was integrated into assisted living standards, he met with Earl Reeder to work on a building that would fit in with the community and the Sugar Camp/Pointe Oakwood Development.

Mr. Reeder explained his challenge was to take all the data and build a physical solution that matched finances for a building on the site that has slope and soil issues. He developed a plan to have the basement on the west side fit into the sloped land and near the existing utilities. As he developed the vertical building, he integrated the variety of units and a building that would fit into Oakwood based on imagery taken from homes in the area. Mr. Reeder reviewed the shingle style architecture which blends in with Sugar Camp/Pointe Oakwood, a comfortable place for seniors to age in a dignified manner. He reviewed the self-contained outdoor courtyard area where memory care residents can enjoy the outdoors. Mr. Reeder explained he put the assisted living dining facility on the third floor so residents could enjoy the great view of the city and Old River as well as a private dining area on that floor for family events. He reviewed the tower in front of the building which also functions as the elevator/lobby, a gathering space. Mr. Reeder indicated it's been a pleasure to work on this project.

Mr. Schear referenced timing of the project and explained once a final operator has been selected, they hope to begin construction yet this year and anticipates 12-18 months for occupancy.

Mr. Shulman opened the meeting for comments.

Ms. Karen Haverland, Roanoke, indicated she worked at Brookdale for over seven years and knows that 911 is called a lot. She asked whether this new facility will stretch the city's manpower for both assisted facilities and the community. Mr. Weiskircher indicated in 2011, there were 72 runs to Brookdale and since this is a larger facility, the number of annual runs could approach 90-100. He noted the city has the capability to service another assisted living facility; the safety department is aware of this application and has asked for input on the elevator based on challenges with removing patients. Mr. Klopsch explained the city is facing a major financial challenge, there are several community meetings taking place in regard to the upcoming loss of estate tax. During those community meetings, it's shown that the safety department is 40% of the city's budget since this is a combined department trained in all three areas; police, fire, and EMS. In large part, they pay for the officers to be ready, not based on the number of runs. Mr. Klopsch indicated in order to keep skills sharp, training is needed in all three disciplines and fortunately the weakest is fire, then EMS. He indicated the department is not overwhelmed; in fact more runs will assist with the officers further honing their skills. Mr. Aidt asked if the city has any mutual aid agreements. Mr. Klopsch responded yes, with Kettering and Dayton. Mrs. Gowdy asked how many simultaneous runs there can be. Mr. Klopsch responded two. Mrs. Jackson asked about EMS needs based on a facility this size. Mr. Peters responded it would not be exponentially doubled and their staff is proactive. Mrs. Jackson wondered how the elevators compare to Brookdale. Mr. Peters is unaware of the Brookdale elevators. Mr. Reeder explained the scale of the proposed elevator allows access to a gurney, similar to a hospital. He explained there are three elevators in the proposed building and he plans to meet with the fire department prior to final detailed drawings. Mr. Aidt wondered if this larger facility might have more staff to take care of minor medical issues which would lessen the medic runs. Mr. Peters indicated the home includes 24-hour nursing.

Mr. Tom Wild, W. Dixon, indicated there are nurses at Brookdale, they don't call 911 unnecessarily, and asked if the city charges for the medic run. Mr. Klopsch indicated the city charges the insurance carrier for the run. Mr. Wild noted medic runs are revenue generating and there is no need to increase staff levels for this new facility. Mr. Wild explained they have concerns that in 2007 the city counted on the estate tax to help fund this site development and although these drawings look nice, they don't think at the north corp limit of Oakwood, they need a 90,000 s.f. building. Mr. Wild questioned the need for this facility and checked with local and independent facilities, most of which had vacancies. He also expressed concern with medic runs and doesn't want to see citizens put at risk while the medic is at these facilities. Mr. Wild expressed concern that they don't know who will operate this facility so there is a potential it will be run by a religious organization (non-profit) and thus no property tax will be generated. He believes there are too many unanswered questions. Mrs. Gowdy wondered who he is speaking on behalf of. Mr. Wild explained a group of citizens that formed about five years ago "Invest in Oakwood". Mrs. Gowdy asked how many are in that group. Mr. Wild responded 30; including Tom Donnelly and they have an incorporated group. Mrs. Gowdy asked how they discussed this request. Mr. Wild responded by phone.

Mrs. Jackson referenced the marketing study that showed Brookdale had 96.8% occupancy, and asked Mr. Wild about vacancies. Mr. Wild explained he contacted nearby facilities and was told they had vacancies with no one on the waiting list based on the economy. Ms. Prutzer asked if he spoke with both independent and assisted facilities. Mr. Wild concurred. Ms. Prutzer indicated her survey was undertaken in July, 2011 at certified facilities and at that time, the local occupancies exceeded the national rate. She reviewed statistics at a variety of locations, including Bethany 100%, Brookdale 96.8%, Lincoln Park 100%, etc.

Mr. Shulman asked for other comments. There being none, the hearing was closed. Mrs. Gowdy is pleased to see a mixed-use at this development especially since the Comprehensive Plan made that recommendation. She is concerned with on-site parking, is pleased to see that staff will use the Old River parking lot and that mini vans will shuttle staff. Mr. Peters indicated any overflow parking needs could also be handled at Old River. Mr. Aidt asked if there is a sidewalk for access. Staff concurred and reviewed the plan. Mr. Shulman agreed this is a good idea and a natural since the development's premise is for step down housing and there is no place in Oakwood similar to those in Kettering and Centerville. Mrs. Jackson noted they plan 60 assisted units but only provide parking for 20. Mr. Peters explained at this life stage, residents typically aren't still driving and the facility has a van available. Ms. Prutzer explained this is a continual care facility, after a significant health event, residents need assisted living. Mr. Peters noted they are also providing larger room sizes per requests of seniors.

Therefore, it was moved by Mr. Aidt and seconded by Mrs. Jackson that application #12-2, the application submitted by Oakwood Investment Group LLC to amend the Master Plan for Pointe Oakwood originally approved on April 23, 2007 and amended in May, 2008 and February, 2011 to include a 3 story, 88 unit, 88,727 s.f. residential assisted living facility to be constructed on the corner of Far Hills Avenue and Old River Trail, be recommended to City Council for approval. Upon a viva voce vote on the question of the motion, same passed unanimously and it was so ordered.

The Planning Commission adjourned. The public meeting concluded at 5:54 p.m.

---

CHAIR

ATTEST:

---

CLERK